



INAPPROPRIATE FOR ANY AGE – BAN IT FOREVER!

Listing of Challenges to Collections and Policies in Canadian Libraries in 2016

By Alvin M. Schrader and Donna Bowman
July 2017

A. LIBRARY MATERIALS CHALLENGED IN 2016

BOOKS, GRAPHIC NOVELS, AND COMICS

13 individual titles on the Israeli-Palestinian conflict

10,000 Dresses (challenged by 5 individuals)

Le loup qui ne voulait plus marcher, by Orianne Lallemand (challenged twice by the same patron)

Tut, Tut, Victoria!, by Ed Gould (2 separate copies challenged)

Three Day Road, by Joseph Boyden (challenged by 2 individuals)

And Then There Were None, by Agatha Christie

Arvida, by Samuel Archibald

Battling Boy, by Paul Pope

Blankets, by Craig Thompson

Bedtime for Frances, by Russell Hoban

Cage of Eden, vols. 4 and 5, by Yoshinobu Yamada

Caring for Your Baby and Young Child, by Steven P. Shelov, et al.

Danny and the Dinosaur, by Syd Hoff

The Death of Ivan Ilyich, by Leo Tolstoy

Don't Step on the Crack, by Colin McNaughton

L'Ecole Autour du Monde, by Shakira

Fi madinati harb (There's a War in My Town), by Fatimah al-Din Sharaf

Filthy Rich: A Powerful Billionaire, the Sex Scandal that Undid Him, and All the Justice that Money

Can Buy, by James Patterson, John Connolly with Tim Malloy

The Gay Man's Kama Sutra, by Terry Sanderson

Graveyard Book, vol. 1, Neil Gaiman, illustrated by P. Craig Russell

Gujarat: The Making of a Tragedy, by Siddharth Varadarajan

Little Rat Makes Music, by Monika Bang-Campbell

Ma soeur veut un zizi, by Fabrice Boulanger

Madeline and the Gypsies, by Ludwig Bemelmans

Mrs. Lilly Is Silly, by Dan Gutman, in the "My Weirder School" children's series

The Official (Ontario Ministry of Transportation) Driver's Handbook

One Man, One Woman: A Catholic's Guide to Defending Marriage, by Dale O'Leary

The People vs Muhammad: Psychological Analysis, by J. K. Sheindlin

Power Play, by Eric Walters

Rabbids 1. BWAAAAAAAH, by Thitaume and Romain Pujol

Robert Mapplethorpe: The Photographs, by Paul Martineau and Britt Salvesen

The Santa Trap, by Jonathan Emmett

The Scorpion Rules, by Erin Bow, in the *Prisoners of Peace* young adult series

Surviving With Wolves, by Misha Defonseca
Strike Witches (One-Winged Witches Vol. 2), by Fumikane Shimada (translation of *Katayoku no majyotachi. 2.*)
The Three Incestuous Sisters, by Audrey Niffenegger
Tintin Au Congo, by Hergé
Tintin in America, by Hergé
The Travels of Babar, by Jean de Brunhoff

MAGAZINES

GQ cover of July 2016 issue
 Sports Illustrated (2016 swimsuit edition)

CD BOOKLET

“Hammer of the Witches” (images in the CD liner notes booklet), by Cradle of Filth

AUDIOBOOKS

Empire, by Orson Scott Card
Thank You, Jeeves, by P. G. Wodehouse

DVDs/STREAMING VIDEOS

“Alice: Primera Temporada,” DVD, directed by Karim Aïnouz and Sérgio Machado – 15 episodes: 13 titles in a television series and 2 films

“Child of God,” DVD, directed by James Franco
 “Fifty Shades of Grey,” DVD, directed by Sam Taylor-Johnson
 “For Those in Peril,” DVD, directed by Paul Wright
 “Found,” Phase 4 Films
 “Me Before You,” DVD, directed by Thea Sharrock
 “Old Dog” DVD, by Pema Tseden
 A Quiet Place to Kill, directed by Umberto Lenzi
 “Wolverine: Origin,” DVD, directed by Joe Quesada

B. LIBRARY ACCESS POLICIES CHALLENGED IN 2016

LIBRARY COLLECTIONS

- One complainant wanted all young adult graphic novels similar to *Cage of Eden* by Yoshinobu Yamada – deemed “inappropriate for any age” and full of explicit sexuality, violence (extreme), collective rape, collective murders, “blood from beginning to end” – “banned forever from library shelves.”
- One community group wanted all items on a specific topic in a government library banned, saying that they were not covered by the library’s collections policy. The implication was that they were racist titles: “The challenge focused on works dealing with the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, specifically titles that were deemed to delegitimize the state of Israel. 13 individual titles from the collection were initially identified, but the formal challenge was directed towards any book espousing a similar stance arguing that such titles did not meet the collections mandate of the library.”

- A parent that wanted all LGBTQ/queer lit materials removed from the teen summer reading game implicitly challenged the collection of such materials by the library. The teen librarian pointed out the importance of those materials for making LGBTQ teens feel welcome in the library
- A patron challenged *The Scorpion Rules*, by Erin Bow, and all LGBTQ content like it
- A patron challenged all library materials, including movies, that contained nudity and sexuality, such as *The Gay Man's Kama Sutra*, by Terry Sanderson
- A patron challenged all violent online video games, linked to a challenge of the internet access policy and 3 other policies

LIBRARY LABELLING

- One complainant wanted all library materials, including movies, that contained nudity and sexuality, such as *The Gay Man's Kama Sutra*, by Terry Sanderson, to be labelled appropriately "so that children, as well as adults, do not happen upon it unwillingly." The complaint was prompted by the library's display of new materials, including this particular title, in a high traffic area, and also involved a request to relocate such items.
- A similar challenge to label library materials was received by the same library a few days after the first, probably by the same patron, who complained to a community group about an item that was purchased for the library with its funding entitled *The Scorpion Rules*, by Erin Bow, in the *Prisoners of Peace* young adult series. The complainant regarded the title to be age inappropriate because it contained "a bi-sexual sex scene not alluded to on the cover." But the complaint went much further, seeking to have "all books with homosexual content" labelled appropriately "so that children, as well as adults, do not happen upon it unwillingly." This policy challenge was also directed at the library's shelf location policy.
- A parent wanted a disclaimer put in all copies of the children's picture book, *Le Loup qui ne voulait pas marcher*, for having racist depiction of First Nations people (the book is from France). The same complainant later re-challenged the title and wanted a note put in it "explaining that these are stereotypical images that are no longer acceptable in a time of our *Truth and Reconciliation Report* and actions that Canadians are now compelled to follow." The complainant objected to a two page spread which showed "3 Indigenous men attacking a train with tomahawks and rubber arrows. Very stereotyped images..."
- A complainant wanted a public library to "have [an] advisory about the content" put on the young adult novel, *Power Play*, by Eric Walters, which contains violence and "depictions of underage drinking (14-year-olds), sexual abuse (rape) between coach and young player" and violence
- A parent wanted a public library "to place a warning sticker on the front so parents are aware of content re: spanking and stalling tactics re: going to bed" on the children's picture book, *Bedtime for Frances*, or alternately to change its location
- A patron complaining about "incest, rape, necrophilia" in the film "Found," by Phase 4 Films, wanted it removed or labelled for its content
- A complainant who challenged the children's fiction book, *Mrs. Lilly is Silly*, wanted the book labelled with a warning considering content that they considered unsuited to children
- The complainant who challenged the DVD "For Those in Peril" wanted a warning label put on it regarding its "disturbingly graphic" depiction of teen suicide. The library's response was: "The library does not have the legal authority or expertise to create its own ratings or warning system or to change a film's rating; the Board is aware that some materials are controversial and may offend some patrons."
- The patron challenging the adult nonfiction book *Filthy Rich: A Powerful Billionaire, the Sex Scandal that Undid Him, and All the Justice that Money Can Buy* wanted it labelled "restricted" for its "Very graphic detail of child sexual abuse...not dealt with in a sensitive, empathetic way, but is intended to titillate or shock."

- The patron challenging the graphic novel of *The Graveyard Book*, by Neil Gaiman, wanted it either relocated from children's to young adult, or labelled with a warning of its "graphic nature"
- The parent who challenged the French picture book *Ma soeur veut un zizi* wanted it labelled as being about human sexuality. The library viewed this as partially a challenge to their access policy for children.
- The patron who challenged the adult DVD, "Me Before You," wanted it labelled on the front with a warning of its content. The patron said, "The cover suggests a positive romantic DVD. The story is realistic in many ways but characters are of upper class and have many positive things going for them. However, the underlying subject material is euthanasia and viewers should be warned as the ending is not what is suggested by the cover."

LIBRARY SHELF LOCATION

- This complainant, referenced above, wanted all library materials, including movies, that contained nudity and sexuality, such as *The Gay Man's Kama Sutra*, by Terry Sanderson, to be relocated to a special area reserved for adults 18+. The complaint was prompted by the library's display of new materials, including this title, in a high traffic area, and also involved a request to label such materials.
- A similar challenge to relocate library materials was received by the same library a few days after the first, probably by the same patron, who complained to a community group about an item that was purchased for the library with its funding entitled *The Scorpion Rules*, by Erin Bow, in the *Prisoners of Peace* young adult series. The complainant regarded the title to be age inappropriate because it contained "a bi-sexual sex scene not alluded to on the cover" and sought to have "all books with homosexual content" relocated preferably to a specific shelf marked with a rainbow in a special area reserved for adults 18+. This policy challenge was also directed at the library's labelling policy.
- The parent in the case of the challenge to the children's picture book, *Bedtime for Frances*, alternately wanted the book "remove[d] from [the] shelf or put in another section of [the] library not intended for young children"
- The complainant who challenged the DVD "Child of God" wanted it to be shelved behind the desk and to be available only upon request
- The complainant who challenged the graphic novel *The Graveyard Book* wanted it shelved with the young adult materials, not the children's as it was. It is based on a children's novel by Neil Gaiman. If not relocated, the patron wanted a label put on it warning of its "graphic nature"
- The complainant who challenged the Brazilian TV series, "Alice: Primera Temporada," wanted access to the series restricted. The library did restrict access "after assessing scenes and reviewing definitions in Criminal Code/law."
- The school administrator who challenged the adult novel *Three Day Road*, after its initial challenge by a parent, wanted it restricted. The administrator [not the librarian/library] then restricted it after placing it on a temporary ban while the challenge was processed
- The complainant who challenged the graphic novel, *Blankets*, wanted it to be relocated to the adult from the young adult collection
- The parent who challenged the July 2016 issue of GQ wanted it relocated so that children did not see it
- The complainant who challenged *Madeline and the Gypsies* wanted it relocated to a research only area
- The parent who challenged *The Rabbids v. 1* wanted it reconsidered for the children's collection [i.e., relocated]
- The complainant who challenged *Surviving with Wolves* wanted it reclassified/reshelved as fiction

- The complainant who challenged the DVD “Wolverine: Origins” wanted it relocated from the children’s to the adult DVD collection
- The complainant who challenged *Don’t Step on the Crack* wanted it reconsidered for its suitability for children [in short, relocated]
- The complainant who challenged *Fi madinati harb (There’s a War in My Town)* implicitly questioned its validity for young children (as a picture book), and therefore the library shelf location – the library’s response also answered that implied challenge for the age of the readers and the book’s location in children’s dept.
- The second challenge to *Le Loup qui ne voulait plus marcher* explicitly questioned its presence in the children’s picture book collection

RESTRICTED ACCESS TO ITEMS

- The person who challenged the DVD “Child of God” wanted access to it restricted by having to request it from staff
- The patron who challenged the DVDs *Alice: Primera Temporada* wanted access to them restricted

LIBRARY DISPLAYS

- This challenge, referenced above, was to a book containing nudity and sexuality, *The Gay Man’s Kama Sutra*, by Terry Sanderson, that was on display as part of the library’s new materials section in a high traffic area. The complaint was also directed at the library’s shelf location and content labelling policies.
- One customer was unhappy with the influence of the library’s Pride month display on their children, and asked that the library remove it and focus on displays of “less controversial subject matter” that did not “push an agenda set forth by the municipality.”
- A parent wanted the “Queer Lit” booklist removed from the brochures display in the library’s teen area
- The complainant who challenged the *Sports Illustrated* swimsuit edition wanted it removed from the magazine display, which was implied to be too high traffic for its “Visual soft pornography.” The library responded: “In keeping with our adherence to the Statement on Intellectual Freedom and our commitment to support a diverse collection which reflects varying tastes and points of view, the Library will not be pre-screening magazines before they are put on display, nor will we be removing this issue of *Sports Illustrated*.”

LIBRARY PROGRAMMING

- A parent felt offended by the inclusion of “Queer Lit” as a book category choice in the library’s teen summer reading game, arguing that, “There is a difference between showing respect for all peoples and using the summer reading program as a place to further LGBTQ propaganda. My son recognizes that there are people who choose to live this lifestyle, however it is not a healthy lifestyle to promote to our youth, and it is contrary to God’s plan for human sexuality, love + marriage.” The complainant wanted the Queer Lit category removed from the reading game choices.
- The challenge was against a program “Wicca 101” being offered at the library. A minister and members of their congregation did not feel this was a topic that should be presented at the library.
- “The resident objected to the library’s presentation of ZooTek as a performance for children in the summer. ZooTek is a “travelling zoo” of exotic animals and the resident felt that shows of this type are inherently harmful to animal welfare. The resident wanted the library to promise not to have similar shows in the future.”

LIBRARY INTERNET ACCESS

- A library received a number of challenges from both patrons and staff to child-designated computers in the children's area, wanting them removed (counted as 2 challenges)
- A patron challenged library policy on Internet access for children after witnessing children playing "violent" games online, and further inquired as to whether the volume of these games could be turned down; but what she appeared to be asking was for a ban on violent video games at Internet stations. (What was unspoken was that the library does not apply filtering software to Internet stations, so even those things that are against library policy (illegal activity and viewing or sharing obscenity) are only enforced by observation and possible banning of the offender.)

LIBRARY CHALLENGED MATERIALS

- The high school library's challenged materials policy was not followed by an administrator in the challenge to the novel *Three Day Road*, by Joseph Boyden

LIBRARY ACCESS TO MATERIALS AND SERVICES

- In the case of the challenge to the graphic novel, *Tintin au Congo*, the complainant also wanted children not to have access to the book, when the library's policy is that everybody has access to all materials, and it's up to parents to supervise their children
- The complainant who challenged the adult fiction title *Arvida* implicitly wanted it unavailable to children, as the library responded with its access policy: "The policy of the Library is to provide customers with access to all of our collections, with the stipulation that parents and guardians are expected to take responsibility for what their children read, view, and listen to."
- The library responded to the parent who challenged the children's picture book *Ma soeur veut un zizi* by giving their access policy: "While the library acknowledges your personal response to this book, it is the policy of the Library to provide customers with access to all of our collections, with the stipulation that parents and guardians are expected to take responsibility for what their children read, view, and listen to."
- The patron who challenged library Internet access for children also implicitly challenged the overall access policy, which allows all patrons access to all services and collections, and says that parents must control what services and collections their children access

LIBRARY NOISE

- The patron who challenged the children's access to internet policy also challenged the noise policy, as the children playing the "violent video games" online were making too much noise. The library in question said that they were monitoring noise levels.