

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data
(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
Books									
All books about Scientology	Inaccurate Information, Political view, Promotes Hatred, Quality of Content, Racism, Religion	Adult on own behalf	Customer wished to have all books on Scientology removed because they are a cult.	None		Removal	Customer was contacted by the Collection Development Librarian for Adult Materials. She pointed out that although Scientology is a controversial topic, many people are interested in reading about it. As well, we have many other books explores the topic from all viewpoints. As such, it fits into our selection policy, and we planned to keep the titles. Customer understood our position but did not agree with it.	No Change to Status	NS
All books by Daniel Amen.	Creator of Work	Adult on own behalf	Customer wanted us to remove books by the author Daniel Amen. Customer felt the author uses his books to sell vitamins and promote his clinics.	None		Removal	Customer was contacted by the Manager, Collection Development. The collection development policy and selection buying practices were explained, and although the customer may not care for the author's motives, he is qualified to give medical advice, and his books are extremely popular. The customer changed his mind after this conversation and was happy we were keeping the books.	No Change to Status	NS

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
<i>Archie vs Predator</i> by Alex de Campi	Inappropriate for Age	Adult on own behalf	A customer was concerned that the comic is not appropriate for children and should be removed from the collection.	None		Re-classification	EPL classified that the title is in the Teen graphic novel collection, indicating that the intended audience is ages thirteen and above. For this reason, EPL maintained the title, Archie vs Predator, in the Teen graphic novel collection. We recognize that this is not a traditional representation of the Archie comic character and as such, have classified it so that it is shelved away from the Children's graphic novel section.	Alternative action taken	AB
<i>al-Ṭibbal-Ṭibb, Bookal-khalāy ā al-jidh'īyah, al-jīnāt wa-al-ash'ah al-khāriqah</i> by Anne Rooney Book: <i>Taqsim ala watr munfarid</i> <i>Taqsim ala watr munfarid ḥīna nará wa-nuqra wa-naktub</i> by Labbas, Jūzif Ṭāniyūs Book:	Inappropriate for Age, Sexually Explicit	Adult on behalf of child/children (incl. parents)	A customer was concerned that the content within the book is too advanced for children. It has a lot of medical terminology in Arabic that children won't understand.	None		Re-classification	This book was reclassified to the Adult Collection.	Action proposed taken	AB

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
<i>al-Ta'īm min al-mahdal-Ta'īm min al-mahd, Bookal-istifāda h min waqt la'ib al-ṭifl fī al-ta'īm ghayr al-mubāshir</i> by Şiddīq, Faḥṭīyah Maḥmūd									
<i>Chat-peau d'cowboy</i> by Stephanie Dunand-Pallaz	Racism	Library Staff Member	Inappropriate depiction of and wording toward Indigenous peoples (reference that "Maudit indiens" are drinking and lazy).	None		Removal	The book was withdrawn.	Action proposed taken	ON
<i>Chloe tells you how to sew</i> , by Chloe Owens	Cultural Appropriation	Adult on own behalf	This title included a craft - How to Make a Feather Headdress. Felt that this was an example of cultural appropriation - the author does not appear to have any connection with Plains nations. Plains Nations people could read the book and be upset, and non-Indigenous people could feel encouraged to make the craft and further the cultural appropriation.	None		Removal	Item was retained.	No Change to Status	BC
<i>Croc copain</i> by Lucie Phan	Inappropriate for Age	Adult on own behalf	Un livre qui manipule l'audience (typiquement un enfant), a etre affectueux envers le lecteur	None		Removal	The book was kept, it has good reviews and can be found in other libraries	No Change to Status	ON

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
<i>Emily's Runaway Imagination</i> by Beverly Cleary	Racism	Adult on behalf of child/ch ildren (incl. parents)	Request for reconsideration of Beverly Cleary's 1961 children's book, Emily's Runaway Imagination. Patron objects to characters in the story making fun of a man's proficiency with the English language: "we should not be teaching children that this is funny or acceptable."	None		Removal	Decision of Collection Advisory Group: title to remain in collection.	No Change to Status	BC
<i>Encyclopedia Brown Solves It All</i>	Truth & Reconciliation	Adult on behalf of child/ch ildren (incl. parents)	We received a complaint about the descriptions of Indigenous people in Encyclopedia Brown Solves It All. According to the customer, "I understand that a book of this vintage will have some "dated" content and I often use such content as "teaching moments" with my children. However, the story starting on page 25 contains many racist terms, none of which I think a child should be reading. Examples include "redskins", "scalping", "war paint" and generally describes first nations in a derogatory fashion. It greatly concerns me that a child would read this content on their own."	None		Removal	We responded to the customer that we have elected to retain the title based on our Collection Development Policy, customer demand, and critical reception.	No formal resolution	BC
<i>Fils unique et fiere de l'etre</i> par Celine Laurens	Cultural Appropriation,	Adult on behalf of child/ch	Inappropriate depiction of white character wearing Indigenous costume	None		Removal	The book was withdrawn.	Action proposed taken	ON

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
		ildren (incl. parents)							
<i>Finn</i> by John Clinch	Promotes Hatred, Racism, Violence	Adult on own behalf	Patron submitted a complaint via email regarding the book "Finn" by John Clinch. They felt that the title depicted graphic scenes and themes which were racist and inappropriate. They wanted it removed from the collection.	Email		Removal	A staff member did a large amount of research related to this title and focused on the fact that it was a novel about racism (and not trying to be gratuitously racist). The patron was stubborn and not interested in any type of reply from the library. We left it in the collection.	No formal resolution	BC
<i>Gender Queer</i> by Maia Kobabe	Inappropriate for Age, Sexually Explicit, Pedophilia	Adult on own behalf	The Teen graphic novel Gender Queer by Maia Kobabe was challenged by a library patron, first by leaving an anonymous voicemail on an Information Desk phone line, then through an email where they did identify themselves. The patron felt the book was controversial and questioned the library policy on graphic pornography and pedophilia aimed at teens and young adults. No actual Request for Reconsideration form was ever submitted.	None		Removal	Patron proposed the item be removed from the collection. At this point, the patron has yet to be formally contacted as a correct response is formulated, however, the library will not be removing the item.	No Change to Status	BC
<i>Ghost Hunter's Handbook</i> by Liz Gardner	Inappropriate for Age	Adult on behalf of child/children	Parent read part of book with 5-year-old and objects to "morbid" content including photograph of Battle of Gettysburg battlefield.	None		Re-classification	Item retained in intermediate-level (for 8–12-year-olds) children's nonfiction collection.	No Change to Status	BC

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant (incl. parents)	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
<i>Ghost in the Shell</i> by Masamune Shirow	Inappropriate for Age, Sexually Explicit	Adult on own behalf	Patron concerned that the graphic novel is pornographic and available in the library with no age restrictions attached to it.			Removal	Retained	No Change to Status	ON
Halloween Surprise by Corinne Demas	Racism	Adult on behalf of child/children (incl. parents)	A customer was concerned that the book contains a culturally derogatory word “gypsy” and there is no discussion around why it’s not an acceptable word. Does not want children to read the book thinking it is okay to use this word.	None		Removal	This book will remain in the library's collection.	No Change to Status	AB
<i>Happy Home Outside: Everyday Magic for Outdoor Life</i> , by Charlotte Hedeman Gueniau	Cultural Appropriation, Racism, Truth & Reconciliation	Adult on own behalf	A library user brought the book up to a staff member, pointing out that the book contained inappropriate imagery and text related to Indigenous peoples. The book is a craft book, and one of the crafts is titled "Tipi - Hee Hee!". The text invites crafters to "make yourself believe you are a Native American squaw ready to dance around the totem pole at any moment...feel like you are a part of a Disney movie..."	None			The selectors determined that the content was not in the spirit of an inclusive collection, and that the book added no special or specific value that could not be found elsewhere, so the book was removed from the collection.	Other, no solution was proposed, the library staff elected to remove the item	ON

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
<i>How to Draw Manga: Basics and Beyond!</i> - by Manga University (Author), Ryo Katagiri (Author), Hiroyuki Sengoku (Author), Yukio Onishi (Author)	Inappropriate for Age, Sexually Explicit	Adult on behalf of child/children (incl. parents)	We received a note in our return box with a book. The note outlined the complainant's issue that the how to draw book was sexually explicit and sent the wrong message to young boys and girls. She suggested that all Japanese manga/anime be removed from the library and that it was disappointing to have found this book in the juvenile non-fiction.	None		Re-classification	Item was moved to Adult Non-Fiction.	Alternative action taken	BC
<i>Irreversible Damage</i>	Promotes Hatred, LGBTQIA2S+: hurtful to community	Adult on own behalf	The library received an email with a person concerned about Irreversible Damage. The person did not wish to discuss it further so no additional follow up was possible.	None		Other: discussion	No further conversation possible without patron contact information	No Change to Status	AB
<i>Irreversible Damage</i>	LGBTQIA2S+: concern about book	Adult on own behalf	Patron contacted Library with concerns over Irreversible Damage	None		Other	Manager had hour long conversation with patron, listening to each others' points of view	No Change to Status	AB

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
<i>Irreversible Damage</i> - Abigail Shrier	LGBTQIA2S+: Irreversible Damage	Adult on own behalf	Patron was concerned about book Irreversible Damage.	Twitter	https://twitter.com/LiamProst/status/1388550471468478467	Other: conversation but no changes	Collections Manager had a conversation with the patron. This did not advance to an official reconsideration request.	No Change to Status	AB
<i>Irreversible Damage: The Transgender Craze Seducing Our Daughters</i> Abigail Shrier	LGBTQIA2S+: anti-trans item, Anti-trans, transphobic	Adult on own behalf	The library patron saw a CTV news story about a request for this book to be removed from Ottawa Public Library's collection. When they checked the Saskatchewan shared catalogue (SILS) and saw that it was available at two library locations, she submitted a request through an online ticketing system called Ask a Librarian to have the book removed. In follow-up, a formal Request for Reconsideration form was filled out on their behalf. The complainant argued the book is transphobic, that some parents could read this book and not support their transgender children, that it could result in harm to trans youth and that suicide rates could rise among that vulnerable population.	None	This was the CTV news story that prompted the challenge to Regina Public Library: https://ottawa.ctvnews.ca/parent-calls-on-ottawa-public-library-to-remove-controversial-book-about-transgender-youth-1.5412620	Removal	A formal letter was sent to the complainant outlining the library's commitment to intellectual freedom, explaining there was community interest and a waitlist for this item, and that the item in question would not be removed from the collection.	No Change to Status	SK
<i>Irreversible damage</i> by Abigail Schrier	Inaccurate Information, Promotes Hatred, LGBTQIA2S+: Trans rights	Adult on own behalf	Book with harmful content. Debunked as inaccurate, builds ideology on hate speech	Twitter		Removal	The book was kept under the Intellectual Freedom right.	No Change to Status	ON

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
<i>Irreversible Damage</i> by Abigail Shrier	LGBTQIA2S+: anti-trans item	individual, age unknown.	message sent via social media asking why our library is purchasing transphobic books, citing a particular new item.	Instagram		Removal	Sent personal message to patron, item retained.	No formal resolution	BC
<i>Irreversible Damage</i> by Abigail Shrier	Inaccurate Information, Promotes Hatred, LGBTQIA2S+: Transphobia	Adult on own behalf	Irreversible Damage by Abigail Shrier - We received 16 official complaints and numerous unofficial ones. The main concern expressed was transphobia and the possibility of hate speech.	Email, Others	https://blueheron.noblogs.org/post/2021/01/10/books-that-enable-child-abuse-do-not-belong/	Removal	After a lengthy review by multiple librarians and a discussion at the board level the book was retained in the collection.	No Change to Status	ON
<i>Irreversible Damage</i> by Abigail Shrier	Promotes Hatred	Adult on own behalf	The title (Irreversible Damages) is harmful, false science, not based in facts and overtly anti trans.	Email		Removal	Via email discussed Intellectual Freedom policy with patron.	No formal resolution	BC
<i>Irreversible Damage</i> by Abigail Shrier	Inaccurate Information, Promotes Hatred, LGBTQIA2S+: Anti-trans	Youth (12-18)	Patron filed formal challenge to Irreversible Damage by Abigail Shrier on the grounds that it could cause harm to transgender youth and discourage parents from accepting their children's gender identities.	None		Removal	Responded in writing that the library supports intellectual freedom, which means that some controversial items will be in the collection. The item was not removed.	No Change to Status	BC

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
<i>Irreversible Damage</i> by Abigail Shrier	LGBTQIA2S+: Anti-trans	Adult on own behalf	Patron submitted complaint via BiblioCommons feedback asking that the book <i>Irreversible Damage</i> by Abigail Shrier be removed from the Collection as it promoted "dangerous misconceptions about gender identity" and did more harm than good	None		Removal	Patron, in their "complaint" while asking we reconsider having the book available, acknowledged that the library had books on trans issues written by trans people and thanked us for doing this as "not all libraries do."	No Change to Status	BC
<i>Irreversible Damage</i> , Abigail Shrier	Inaccurate Information, Sexually explicit, LGBTQIA2S+: Anti-transgender	Adult on own behalf	Complainant used the library's "Request for Reconsideration of a Work in the Library's Collection" to challenge the book and to request that it be removed from the library's collection. Information provided: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The work is based on a highly contested, largely discredited 2018 article - The book could be used to invalidate the identities of trans people, especially children, which will exacerbate the incidence of suicide among trans teens, and violence against the trans community - Would not recommend the book as it is based on inaccurate and harmful information - The information the book is based on is a refuted study 	None		Removal	A letter was mailed to the customer explaining the library's commitment to upholding the principles of intellectual freedom and that the book would not be removed from the collection.	No Change to Status	SK

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
			- The purpose of this book seems to be to discredit the trans experience.						
<i>Irreversible Damage</i> , by Abigail Shrier	Creator of Work, Inaccurate Information, Policy, Promotes Hatred, Quality of Content, LGBTQIA2S+: anti-trans	Community Group or Organization	Two petitions were circulated by community members, requesting the library remove the book, "Irreversible Damage" by Abigail Shrier. https://www.change.org/p/halifax-public-libraries-remove-anti-trans-hate-from-halifax-public-libraries	Email, Others	https://www.halifaxexaminer.ca/featured/if-the-library-is-safe-for-transphobia-its-not-safe-for-trans-people/ , https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/nova-scotia/pride-breaks-with-halifax-libraries-after-controversial-book-kept-on-shelves-1.6045823 , https://nationalpost.com/opinion/adam-zivo-pride-boycott-of-halifax-library-a-disturbing-attack-on-free-expression	Removal	https://www.halifaxpubliclibraries.ca/news/response-community-petition-for-book-removal/	Alternative action taken	NS

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
<i>Irreversible Damage: the transgender craze seducing our daughters</i> by Abigail Shrier	Inaccurate Information, Promotes Hatred, Quality of Content, Transgender	Adult on own behalf	Completed Materials Reconsideration form. Concerns include: - "author has no expertise in subject of medicine or psychology" - includes "statements and claims which are highly offensive to LGBTQ+ community" - "book has no literary merit" - content "risks aggravating community members for no reason" - "bullying under the guise of journalism" - "misinforms readers" - "justifies intolerance"	None		Removal	Written response included: - information about the author - reviews that support people's right to access the book - in contrast to this one title - the library has 3000+ books about gender and sexual identity - for all ages - with a supportive perspective - link to Pride resources at library - library provides diverse collections with a balance of viewpoints - library will continue to purchase titles that represent and support our diverse communities, including those who are transgender	No Change to Status	ON
<i>Irreversible Damage: The Transgender Craze Seducing Our Daughters</i> by Abigail Shrier	Inaccurate Information, Promotes Hatred, LGBTQIA2S+: Transsexuality	Adult on own behalf	Email with letter attached rec'd July 2021. Complainant wanted to challenge an item in the collection. "I generally disagree with its inclusion in your collection, I have a larger disagreement with its inclusion in the libraries [sic] non-fiction section as the ideas expressed in this book have little basis in fact."	None		Other: Removal or reclassification	The Manager of Public Services and Manager of Collections set up a phone appt. with complainant. We listened, and explained our position, and then forwarded all the materials required to make a formal collection challenge. It was an amicable conversation. Complainant did not follow through with our "Reconsideration of Materials" form.	No Change to Status	AB

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
<i>Irreversible Damage: The Transgender Craze Seducing Our Daughters</i> (2020) book by Abigail Shrier, published by Regnery Publishing.	LGBTQIA2S+: anti-Transgender (females)	Adult on own behalf	A customer requested the removal of "Irreversible Damage: The Transgender Craze Seducing Our Daughters" by Abigail Shrier from the Library. In his view, this book is "harmful and contains blatantly false information," and its anti-trans. It even refers to the "trans epidemic."	None	<p>No media reports from our library, but there are many from others.</p> <p>https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/nova-scotia/pride-breaks-with-halifax-libraries-after-controversial-book-kept-on-shelves-1.6045823, https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Irreversible_Damage, https://www.nbcnews.com/feature/nbc-out/amazon-will-not-remove-book-advocates-say-endangers-transgende</p>	Other: Purchasing a copy	<p>A customer complained about this title as being "inappropriate." When we started our investigation, we discovered that we only have MARK records in our catalogue but no active link to the audiobook on the Hoopla platform. When we approached the vendor to see if they self-censored the title after the case in Halifax Public Library, we learned the title is "no longer available to Hoopla from the distributor." CPL is mutually committed to intellectual freedom. We share the CFLA belief that it is only "through access to a wide range of ideas and opinions that diversity and inclusion are truly supported".</p> <p>http://cfla-fcab.ca/wp-content/uploads/2021/07/Challenges-to-the-book-Irreversible-Damage-by-Abigail-Shrier-%E2%80%93-a-CFLA-FCAB-Intellectual-Freedom-Brief-1.pdf</p>	Other:	BC

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
					r-youth-n1266447, https://ottawa.ctvnews.ca/parent-calls-on-ottawa-public-library-to-remove-controversial-book-about-transgender-youth-1.5412620 ,				
<i>Irreversible Damage: The Transgender Craze Seducing Our Daughters</i> by Abigail Shrier	Inaccurate Information, Quality of Content, LGBTQIA2S+: transgender	Adult on own behalf	A customer submitted a request to remove "Irreversible Damage: The Transgender Craze Seducing Our Daughters" by Abigail Shrier. According to the customer, "This book is harmful and contains blatantly false information (ex, puberty blockers cause infertility, only males experienced gender dysphoria until hip trans influencers came along to seduce young girls, etc.), and is overtly anti-trans. It even refers to the "trans epidemic". I believe it's important to be able to hold conversations about difficult and controversial subjects, but the library is supposed to be a haven of learning and information.	Email	n/a	Removal	We identified that we did not actually have a copy of the book. The customer found a record for the book in our catalogue. However, there were no linked item records. It is our assumption that we received the MARC record from our vendor by error.	No formal resolution	BC

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
			People trust that the material they find in the library is reputable and factual, and this book is neither of those things."						
<i>Irreversible Damage: The Transgender Craze Seducing Our Daughters</i> by Abigail Shrier	Inaccurate Information, Political view, Promotes Hatred, LGBTQIA2S+: Transphobia	Library Staff Member	Customers and staff complained about Irreversible Damage by Abigail Shrier being homophobic and promoting hatred of and possibly harm against people in the LGBTQIA+ community.	None		Removal	Left in the collection. Talking points given to staff on why.	No Change to Status	ON
<i>Irreversible Damage: The Transgender Craze Seducing our Daughters</i> by Abigail Shrier	LGBTQIA2S+: Book is about transitioning teenagers	Adult on own behalf	Patron emailed the library to express concerns that this title was offensive and potentially harmful to the community.	Email		Removal	A committee of Library staff reviewed the book and chose to retain it in the collection. The patron was contacted to initiate a conversation. The library received no reply.	No Change to Status	AB

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
<i>Irreversible Damage: The Transgender Craze Seducing our Daughters</i> by Abigail Shrier.	Profanity, LGBTQIA2S+: The book is focused on transitioning teenagers.	Adult on own behalf	A patron emailed the library to request that this title be removed as they found it offensive and misleading.	Email		Removal	A Library committee had previously reviewed this title and chosen to retain it after receiving a similar complaint. The patron was contacted with an offer to discuss, no reply was received.	No Change to Status	AB
<i>It Isn't Rude to be Nude</i> written and illustrated by Rosie Haine.	Inappropriate for Age, Sexually Explicit	Adult on behalf of child/children (incl. parents)	Emailed concern to the library about "inappropriate book in the children's section". Concerns included: - "young children looking at crudely drawn graphic photos of naked adults is not 'okay' by any stretch" - "confusing message contrary to the more necessary idea that of private parts being private" - could "condition children to explicit images"			Removal	Responded to customer via email with this information: - reviews of book - including repeated comments about celebration of bodies and body positivity - background of author/illustrator - library encourages parents to assess titles regarding suitability for their own children and to read with their children to "place language, pictures and subject matter in context"	No Change to Status	ON

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
<i>Jewish Scheming</i> (translated from Mandarin) by Yafan Wen	Promotes Hatred	Adult on own behalf	Jewish Scheming (translated from Mandarin) Cover is a star of David with dollar signs inside it, and a pair of hands reaching for them. Patron identified both the book and the cover as anti-Semitic and promoting hatred towards Jewish people.	None		Removal	Staff member who is literate in Mandarin reviewed the text, and in their opinion the book did not promote hatred. Also, the work which was translated as “scheming” does not carry the same connotations it does in English. Offered patron the opportunity to challenge book based on cover.	No formal resolution	BC
<i>La corne de rhinoceros</i> by Franquin	Racism	Library Staff Member	Racist depiction, story of racialized characters.	None		Removal	The book was retained but a fuller study will be done in 2022. Had previous complaint about Spirou series. Are they classic? Satiric in nature-ok for Teens and Adults?	No Change to Status	ON
<i>La licorne dans ma cabane</i> par Eric Battut	Racism, Truth & Reconciliation	Library Staff Member	Potentially insensitive reference to Indigenous peoples	None		Removal	The book was withdrawn	Action proposed taken	ON
<i>Le livre des C'est pas moi!</i> by Herve Eparvier	Cultural Appropriation, Truth & Reconciliation	Library Staff Member	Inappropriate depiction of white character(s) wearing Indigenous clothing/costume	None		Removal	The book was withdrawn.	Action proposed taken	ON
<i>Le loup qui ne voulait plus marcher</i> by Oriane Lallemand	Racism, Truth & Reconciliation	Adult on own behalf	Stereotyped images in a 2-page spread depicting 3 Indigenous men attacking a train with tomahawks and rubber arrows. Offensive and racist.			Removal	The decision was made to withdraw all copies of the book, as the 2020 Reconciliation views regarding offensive text\illustrations towards Indigenous people has changed from 2016.	Action proposed taken	ON
<i>Le petit livre des premieres fois</i> par	Cultural Appropriation,	Library Staff	Inappropriate depiction of white character wearing Indigenous costume			Removal	The book was withdrawn from the collection.	Action proposed taken	ON

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
Stephane Daniel	Truth & Reconciliation	Member							
<i>Les filles peuvent le faire aussi!</i> par Sophie Gourion	Cultural Appropriation, Truth & Reconciliation	Adult on behalf of child/children (incl. parents)	Inappropriate depiction of white character wearing Indigenous costumes	None		Removal	The book was withdrawn	Alternative action taken	ON
<i>Let's talk about it: the teen's guide to sex, relationships, and being a human</i> by Erika Moen	Sexually Explicit	Adult on own behalf	Depiction of graphic cartoon images of sexual acts and should not be available to youth under 18 years old.	None		Re-classification	The book was moved into the Teen Non-Fiction collection because the Teen Graphic novels collection has books aimed at a younger age group.	Action proposed taken	ON
<i>Mai Que Font Les Parents la Nuit?</i> By Thierry Lenain & Barroux	Cultural Appropriation, Racism, Truth & Reconciliation	Library Staff Member	Inappropriate depiction of white character(s) wearing Indigenous clothing/costume			Removal	Withdrawn. Images depicting cultural appropriation could be racist/insensitive. For preschool material, images could be powerful and/or harmful.	Action proposed taken	ON
<i>Mog's Amazing Birthday Caper</i> by Judith Kerr	Cultural Appropriation, Racism	Adult on own behalf	The children's picture book, <i>Mog's Amazing Birthday Caper</i> by Judith Kerr was brought to our attention as containing offensive content related to Indigenous people: 1) Indigenous regalia used as a costume 2) the use of the word "Indian" to describe Indigenous people	None		Removal	The book was removed from the collection. Upon review, the staff agreed that the racist stereotypes were not helpful in building a safer and more inclusive collection in our library, and that the retention of the book would not serve a significant educational purpose.	Other, No action was proposed by the complainant, the item was merely brought to	ON

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
			3) the presence of an Indigenous person whose sole purpose is to protect White people and facilitate the narrative of the protagonists					SPL's attention	
<i>Mon bebe aspirateur</i> par Beatrice Fontanel	Cultural Appropriation, Truth & Reconciliation	Library Staff Member	Inappropriate depiction of white character wearing Indigenous clothing / costume	None		Removal	The book was removed from the collection.	Action proposed taken	ON
<i>Mon oncle, ce farfelu</i> par Yvonne Jagtenberg	Cultural Appropriation, Truth & Reconciliation	Library Staff Member	The nephew and uncle characters dress up and pretend to be "indians", wearing Aboriginal headdresses with tomahawk, etc..	None		Removal	the book was withdrawn from the collection	Action proposed taken	ON
<i>Night School</i> by Lee Child	Sexually Explicit, Violence	Adult on own behalf	Graphic descriptions of violent sexual actions against females.			Removal	Popular title with our customers. Other Canadian libraries owns this book.	No Change to Status	ON
<i>Notre neige a nous</i> by Thomas Scotto	Racism, Truth & Reconciliation	Adult on behalf of child/children (incl. parents)	Term "Esquimaux" is used in the book.	None		Removal	The word Esquimaux was only used once in the book and is referring to "how cold it is" and not equating the Indigenous group with "sauvage". Title is in Juv Fiction collection; children are older, they can understand this rationale better than preschoolers.	No Change to Status	ON
<i>Petit poilu : les sauveurs d'Outoupousse</i> by Pierre Bailey	Cultural Appropriation, Racism, Truth & Reconciliation	Library Staff Member	Petit Poilu and his Indigenous friend fight tree cutting. The objection came because the Indigenous girl is a caricature-does rain dance and lives in tepee. The book description at page 31 says it's "une histoire un brin spirituelle et chamanique"	None		Removal	It is a series that has been well received both by critics and by Ottawa Public Library customers. Not enough inappropriate depiction of Indigenous Peoples to warrant discarding the book. Some view this story as a successful fight by Poilu and his friend (environmentalist)	No Change to Status	ON

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
							against tree cutting and a big industry. Also, Poilu and his Indigenous friend work together - depicts successful partnership, friendship.		
<i>Gender Queer</i> by Maia Kobabe	Sexually Explicit, LGBTQIA2S+: Grooming	Adult on own behalf	Complainant felt that <i>Queer</i> by Maia Kobabe was Child Pornography. Complaint felt like a hit and run scare email. When I emailed a copy of our Request for Reconsideration form, the complainant did not respond.	None			When I emailed a copy of our Request for Reconsideration form, the complainant did not respond. Item is still available. Only a digital copy in our collection	No formal resolution	ON
<i>Sex is a Funny Word</i> by Corey Silverberg and Fiona Smith	Sexually Explicit, LGBTQIA2S+: Gender identity	Adult on behalf of child/children (incl. parents)	A customer submitted a Request for Materials Reconsideration on Sept. 1 for " <i>Sex is a Funny Word</i> " by Cory Silverberg and Fiona Smith. The request stated "I found this book with my seven-year-old boy. It was placed on the shelf with books for young children! It is vulgar and inappropriate. This is poison for young mind[s] and books like this should be removed ... What message do you get by reading this title? Out body is a god temple, not a pig sty! My child in disbelief brought it to me. He was disgusted."	None	n/a	Removal	We responded to the customer with information about our collections policy and our decision to keep the book as part of our collection. There was no further correspondence.	No Change to Status	BC

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
<i>Showdown with Iran</i> by Mark Hitchcock	Political view, Promotes Hatred, Racism, Religion	Adult on own behalf	Emailed complaint that a new book on display in library is "vilifying Iran and Iranian people", that the book "uses dangerous religious ideology to support its analysis of Iran and Western relations with Iran". Book made customer feel "unsafe" in library and requested that the book be removed from the collection.	None		Removal	Written response by library that the focus of the book is Bible prophecy about Iran, not current politics, and foreign relations. Responded that the library carries many other books about the politics and government of Iran and foreign relations with Iran. Library will keep book, as per its current classification with other books about religion.	No Change to Status	ON
<i>Simon est tete en l'air</i> by Sophie Mullenheim	Cultural Appropriation	Library Staff Member	Simon the raccoon, a character, finds an Indian costume (feathered headband and hatchet). The book is using First nations culture as a dress up game.	None		Removal	The book was withdrawn	Action proposed taken	ON
<i>Sous le soleil exactement</i> par Anne-Fleur Multon	Profanity	Library Staff Member	Lots of swear words	None		Re-classification	The book was changed from the Juv collection to the Teen collection	Action proposed taken	ON
<i>Spirou et Fantasio : Les debuts d'un dessinateur</i> v.1 par Franquin	Racism	Library Staff Member	Depiction of Indigenous or Black characters	None		Removal	Spirou is a classic series. Decision to retain the book - satire in book would be understood by teen audience.	No Change to Status	ON
<i>The Case of Alan Turing</i> by Eric Liberge and Arnaud Delalande	Inappropriate for Age, LGBTQIA2S+: homoerotic suggestions	Adult on behalf of child/children (incl. parents)	A customer's child signed out an adult graphic novel with male nudity.	None		Removal	Letter was written explaining that the graphic novel format is not a format specifically aimed at children and explained how to read spine labels to find children's graphic novels.	No Change to Status	Sk

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
<i>The fox went out on a chilly night</i> by Peter Spier	Inappropriate for Age	Library Staff Member	Images of a fox catching and eating a goose is offensive to children	None		Re-classification	This book is based on an old English folk song. It is a Caldecott Honor winner and has received good reviews. Classified as a Picture Book in other public libraries in North America	No Change to Status	ON
<i>The Infinite Moment of Us, Me and Earl and the Dying Girl</i> , and <i>Gender Queer</i>	Inappropriate for Age	Sent by a local councillor or on behalf of resident, asking for my comment	Patron felt that "diversity, inclusion, equity, etc." have been weaponized so that everyone promotes these supposed values. He felt that pornography [his word] has found its way into school libraries and "diversity" and "inclusion" are part of the rationale for this. He noted that some of those same books are on the shelves of the Whitby Public Library. He specifically referenced <i>The Infinite Moment of Us, Me and Earl and the Dying Girl</i> , and <i>Gender Queer</i> (this third title had screenshots of portions of the book attached to the email) and asked the councillor if he was "okay with that." He noted that children are under "ideological assault."	None		Other: No proposed action really	I sent a response to the councillor outlining our collection development policy, the Board's commitment to intellectual freedom, and attached a copy of our recommendation for reconsideration form. I also pointed out that I took umbrage at these materials being characterized as "child pornography."	No formal resolution	ON
<i>The Name I Call Myself</i> by Hasan Namir	LGBTQIA2S+: transgender	Adult on behalf of child/ch	Adult female patron objected to the library owning a book on the grounds that it is "confusing for children."			Removal	The patron did not submit a formal written challenge. No action was taken. The book is still available in the picture books section.	No formal resolution	BC

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
		ildren (incl. parents)							
<i>This song is (not for you)</i> by Laura Nowlin	LGBTQIA2S+: Inaccurate representation	Adult on own behalf	The book is framing the character's asexuality as a problem and depicting that being asexual means you have to find workarounds to having a relationship.	None		Labelling	The book was retained without any labels added. It has good reviews and other public libraries have it. Our policy is to not affix warning labels.	No Change to Status	ON
Tous les titres de l'auteur français Stéphane Bourgoin	Inaccurate Information	Adult on own behalf	Demande de retirer les livres de Stéphane Bourgoin des rayons parce qu'ils sont remplis de fausses information.	None		Removal	Livres maintenus dans la collection, ils seront élagués de manière «naturelle»	Alterative action taken	QC
<i>Trans: When Ideology Meets Reality</i> , by Helen Joyce	Promotes Hatred	Adult on own behalf	Book argues against the right of trans people and denies the existence of trans and nonbinary people. Library should remove this material, or purchase hate literature such as the Protocols of the Elders of Zion to be consistent. The library should have a consistent policy for purchasing hate literature.	Email		Other: removal or purchase a diversity of hate literature	Email exchange with patron. Library does hold several of the other titles they named.	No formal resolution	BC
<i>You Can Heal Your Life</i> , by Louise L. Hay	Creator of Work, Inaccurate Information, Quality of Content	Adult on own behalf	A request was made to remove the book because the complainant did not agree with the author's advice (self-help book) and felt it was not helpful to people.	None		Removal	The customer was contacted by the Collection Development Manager. The book is very popular and has been for many years. As such, it fits within our criteria for collection development. Because of this, we were not recommending its withdrawal. Customer accepted the decision, although not happy.	No Change to Status	NS

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
Movies									
Angel by Joss Whedon & David Greenwait	Violence	Adult on own behalf	A customer was concerned that the content of the DVD is too violent and shows demonic depictions.	None		Removal	EPL recognized that many customers find Angel and its related show, Buffy the Vampire Slayer, as well as the graphic novel series that the TV shows are based on, engaging, and diverting entertainment. For this reason, as well as the positive reviews garnered by the series, EPL decided to maintain the title Angel in the Teen DVD collection.	No Change to Status	AB
Hybrid World: The Plan to Modify and Control the Human Race	Sexually Explicit	Adult on own behalf	Complaint about graphic sexual imagery in a DVD, likely in special features section of the disc.	None		Other: specific action not suggested	The DVD and rating were reviewed, item retained in adult DVD collection.	No Change to Status	BC
Promising Young Woman movie dir. Emerald Fennell	Promotes Hatred, Violence, "anti-men"	Adult on own behalf	Patron filed challenge regarding the library offering the DVD Promising Young Woman.	None		Removal	Wrote letter to patron explaining that film critics emphasized that the focus of this film was the rape culture displayed by certain men, and the societal norms that tacitly accept it. And that the library serves a wide audience with many different values, interests, tastes, and concerns. This movie, as disturbing and controversial as it is, belongs in the library dealing as it does with such an important topic and has received such broad attention.	No Change to Status	BC

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data

(All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
That Darn cat, a Disney movie	Violence	Adult on own behalf	Depicts domestic violence and violence against women			Removal	Retained. It received good reviews and is available in other Public Libraries	No Change to Status	ON
The Disney Pocahontas movie	Inaccurate Information, Truth & Reconciliation	Adult on own behalf	Description is offensive, it is outdated, and doesn't abide by the Truth and Reconciliation Commission.			Removal	The DVDs themselves were dated and had a low circulation; the movie was withdrawn.	Action proposed taken	ON

Program

Reading with Royalty Storytime	LGBTQIA2S+	Several different adults in the community	We offered a Reading with Royalty program- originally planned for May 2020 and delayed till October 2020 due to COVID-19 restrictions. We received several challenges- in person, by phone, and written- as well as a petition. The concerns ranged from those who felt the program was inappropriate for the library, that it was ill-suited for the community, that it would confuse young children, that it was not a good use of tax payer funding, and that the drag king/queen hosts were not reputable (and a number of comments that are very close to hate speech equating homosexuality to pedophilia).	None		Cancel the event (incl. displays)	The Library Board listened to a patron representing a larger group with a petition opposed to the event, as well as a patron in support of the event. The event went ahead as scheduled.	No Change to Status	AB
--------------------------------	------------	---	---	------	--	-----------------------------------	--	---------------------	----

2021 CFLA-FCAB Intellectual Freedom Challenges Survey – Data
 (All incidents occurred in public libraries)

Author/Title	Challenge Category	Complainant	Describe Incident	Social Media?	URL	Proposed Action	Library Response	Outcome	P/T
Service									
COVID-19 Information		Adult on own behalf	CPL has a Covid Guide for the newly introduced Vaccine Cards. The complainant linked it to tyranny in eastern Europe and forcing people to take an experimental vaccine, which is claimed to be a clear violation of the Canadian Constitution.	None	n/a	Removal	Denied the request to remove the material, as it is public information that many customers are looking for	No Change to Status	BC